

## Full Business Case and Options Appraisal

Programme/Project/Service Redesign Information	
Programme/Project/Service Redesign Name	Hollingbury Library proposals
Directorate/Service	Assistant Chief Executive
Full Business Case Author (Name and job title)	Sally McMahon
Date Full Business Case drafted	Version 4 (7 April 2016)
Senior Responsible Owner/ Project Executive (Name and job title)	Paula Murray, Assistant Chief Executive
Programme or Project Manager (Name and job title)	Lucy Castle, Project Manager

### 1. Executive Summary & Recommendations

*Provide a summary of key points of the Business Case and recommendations for the governance group to consider*

This Business Case has been developed to evidence the value of the proposals for changing the location of library service delivery in Hollingbury. This Business Case brings together key information that will inform a report for Policy & Resources Committee on 28<sup>th</sup> April 2016 seeking approval to;

- Sell Hollingbury Library, estimated value of £350,000
- Fund the move of Hollingbury Library to the Hollingbury & Patcham Children's Centre and the Old Boat Community Centre from corporate capital funds, total estimated cost: £51,000

### 2. Objectives

*What will the programme or project achieve/what changes will it bring about?*

Provision of two new library service points in Hollingbury to enable 7 day a week access at reduced running costs by working in partnership with the Children's Centre and the Old Boat Community Centre.

### 3. Background and context

*What events, policies, issues, risks or opportunities have prompted it?*

On 24<sup>th</sup> March 2016 the [Libraries Service Plan](#) was agreed at Full Council. Phase One includes changes to the way library services in community libraries are delivered.

As part of the Libraries Needs analysis a public consultation took place which included a survey that asked the question 'Do you agree or disagree with the proposal to move Hollingbury Library to the Hollingbury Children's Centre and increase Patcham Library hours?' The survey received 1,124 responses in total with the response to this question

## Full Business Case and Options Appraisal

---

48% tending to agree or strongly agree and 22% tending to disagree or strongly disagree, with a high percentage (30%) neither agreed nor disagreed.

An analysis of the responses from those who said they were users of Hollingbury Library produced a different response: 38% tended to agree or strongly agree; 49% tended to disagree or strongly disagree; and 13% neither agreeing nor disagreeing.

As a result of detailed consultation with the Ward Councillors, the original proposals were amended to include the creation of an additional Community Library collection in the Old Boat Community Centre in Hollingbury to meet the library needs of all age groups, and the provision of staffing support to Hollingbury library locations for one day a week each.

As a result of these changes, we believe the main objections raised by local people will be met, as all age groups will be catered for and staff support has been re-introduced.

The current Hollingbury Library building is an old public house building in need of significant repairs estimated at £148,000 and it is one of only two stand alone, isolated community library buildings in the public library network.

The library currently costs £45,000 p.a. to run from this location.

### *Which corporate principles and priorities (as outlined in the Corporate Plan) will it help deliver?*

Citizen focused – working with local residents to deliver programmes and activities relevant to the audience. The new locations will enable us to continue to provide a service that is used by residents to access a wide range of council and public services, general information and the internet. There will be increased opportunities for community involvement in projects and activities.

Increasing equality – ensuring that there continues to be free provision of literature and ICT support to those who need it and providing specialist activities and groups for minority or disadvantaged groups.

Active citizenship - creating more varied opportunities for volunteering and community collaboration within a joined up service.

Economy, jobs & homes – promoting literacy and learning, to improve employment opportunities and ensure digital competency.

Children and young people – working with the Children's Centre, providing a joined up approach to curriculum programming, encouraging of learning and reading, improving literacy.

Community safety and resilience – encouraging community activity and active citizenship that will foster safe neighbourhoods.

Environmental sustainability – the improvements to the community centre with the move of the library into this building will improve the environmental sustainability of this community building.

## Full Business Case and Options Appraisal

*What other programmes, projects or services does it link to?*

This project is part of the Libraries Modernisation Programme which needs to save £1.34 million over the next four years.

The Community Collaboration Programme will suggest improved ways of working with partners, citizens and businesses to ensure community participation in the development and delivery of City objectives. The stronger links to the local community centre and the local Children's Centre and school should be able to utilise this model to ensure that local requirements are met and volunteering opportunities respond to community need.

### 4. Preferred Option

*Indicate which is the preferred option of those described*

Three options have been considered at this point to manage the inflated costs of managing Hove library. These are:

#### OPTION 1.

##### 1. Description of the option

Do nothing. The impact of this option is that savings will not be met, and the high maintenance costs of this 1940's old pub building will continue. Revenue costs would continue at £45,000 p.a. and £148,000 maintenance costs estimated over five years would remain.

#### OPTION 2.

##### 1. Description of the option

Keep Hollingbury Library in its current location and operate it using Libraries Extra arrangements. Less than half the savings needed would be delivered and the buildings maintenance costs will remain. The opportunities to work more closely with the Children's centre, the school and the Community Centre will be lost.

#### OPTION 3: the preferred option

##### 1. Description of the option

*Describe the option that is being explored. Including any evidence base, this should include benchmarking data and needs analysis undertaken.*

Move Hollingbury Library service to two new locations:

- Hollingbury and Patcham Children's Centre to operate a library service targeted at young children and families for three days a week, on a self-serve basis using volunteer help.
- Old Boat Community Centre in Hollingbury operating a seven days a week

## Full Business Case and Options Appraisal

service to library users of all ages, on a self-serve basis using volunteer help and working in partnership with the community centre to provide services to meet the needs of local people.

- There will also be staff input on one day a week covering both locations

This option will provide longer access to local people over seven days of the week and will enable greater community collaboration and engagement, whilst also delivering £26,500 of revenue savings, and avoiding the future maintenance and repairs costs (est £148,000)

### 2. Is this the preferred option?

*Yes or no and a brief explanation why.*

Yes Option 3 is the preferred option. The Library Service has to find its share of savings and Hollingbury is one of only two stand-alone libraries in the city. Research has shown that it is more effective both in terms of performance and efficiency to co-locate libraries with other services. The Review and Needs Analysis identified Hollingbury Library as one that had one of the smallest catchment populations and one of the highest % of library users who already used another library. It was also had a relatively high estimated maintenance and repair costs. The library is not located in the best of positions, at the top of a steep road, which can deter people. Moving the library provision into shared premises, will enable better community involvement in the library and hopefully a higher level of use, at lower cost.

### 3. Cashable benefits

*What are the anticipated financial savings from the programme or project? Profile the savings over the lifetime of the programme or project.*

	<b>Year 1 2016/17</b>	<b>Year 2 2017/18</b>	<b>Year 3 2018/19</b>	<b>Total</b>
<i>Buildings</i>	£2,450	£2,450	0	<b>£4,900 (tbc)</b>
<i>Employees</i>	£9,500	£9,500	0	<b>£19,000</b>
<i>Supplies &amp; Services</i>	£1,550	£1,550	0	<b>£3,100</b>
<i>Income</i>	-£250	-£250	0	<b>-£500</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>£13,250</b>	<b>£13,250</b>		<b>£26,500</b>

### 4. Non-cashable benefits

*Every non-cashable benefit (or improvement) should be expressed in measurable terms, and the current situation understood and baselined before the programme or project is implemented. Include benefits from the perspective of the customer*

<b>Current situation</b>	<b>Benefit expected</b>	<b>Measured outcome that you hope to achieve</b>	<b>How will the benefit be measured?</b>

## Full Business Case and Options Appraisal

Stand-alone building	Improved visitor experience through colocation	Increased attendance and repeat visits	Visitor numbers Visitor feedback
Activities and events are separate	Increased partnership working will result in joint activities and events	Increased attendance at activities	Attendance numbers School visits Visitor feedback
Services are generic	Increased opportunity for targeted services to meet needs of local service users	Improved outcomes for library users	Visitor satisfaction and feedback Community engagement in projects
Relatively low level of library use	Able to reach non-traditional library users	Increased membership	Membership numbers
£148k of maintenance needed for Hollingbury Library(funding is not within existing budget)	Cost is not incurred	Other services do not need to find additional savings	Cost is avoided
Old Boat Community Centre is not known about by whole community	Library presence will help bring more people to the centre and better signage	New users of the Centre	Surveys

### 5. Costs (capital and revenue)

*What are the capital and revenue costs of the programme or project? Profile these costs over the lifetime of the programme or project.*

	<b>Year 1 2016/17 Children's centre</b>	<b>Year 1 2016/17 Old Boat Community centre</b>		<b>Total</b>
<b>Capital costs</b>				
<i>Building costs</i>	£27,000	£20,000		<b>£47,000</b>
<i>Moving costs</i>	£500 (tbc)	£500 (tbc)		<b>£1,000 (tbc)</b>
<i>IT costs</i>	£3,500	£3,500		<b>£7,000</b>
<b>Revenue costs</b>				
<b>Totals (per year) &amp; grand total</b>	£31,000	£24,000		£55,000

*When will payback occur? What is the Return on Capital Employed?*

When library building is sold and capital receipt received

### 6. Funding

*Have the budgets to fund the programme or project been identified? Specify which budgets.*

Capital receipt from sale of library building will fund the new library provision in the Children's Centre and the Old Boat Community Centre.

## Full Business Case and Options Appraisal

Will the programme or project be in receipt of any funding? Profile the funding over the lifetime of the programme or project.				
	<b>Year 1 2016/17</b>	<b>Year 2 2017/18</b>	<b>Year 3 2018/19</b>	<b>Total</b>
<i>Funding</i>	£55,000			<b>£55,000</b>
Please identify the funding source(s)				
<p>Sale of Hollingbury Library – estimated at £350,000</p> <p>Hollingbury Library can be put onto the market following approval from Policy and Resources Committee and once the library service has moved to its new locations.</p>				

<b>7. Resources</b> <i>What staffing resources are required to deliver the programme or project?</i>					
<b>Service</b>	<b>Why are they required?</b>	<b>Quantify the requirement (fte)</b>	<b>When are they required?</b>	<b>Has the service been consulted and what did they say?</b>	<b>Are the staff available?</b>
Operational staff	Form project team Manage stock Pack items		Ongoing		Yes
Library manager	Manage the project		Ongoing	Yes	Yes
Communications	Management of project opposition Promotion of new service		Ongoing		
Finance	Monitor project finances	½ day a month	Ongoing	Yes	Yes
Human Resources & Organisational Development	Advice regarding new staffing roles and JDs	Minimal			
ICT	Fitting of new cables				
Internal Audit	None				
Legal & Democratic Services	Contracts Planning				
Policy, Communities & Equalities	Community engagement				
Procurement	Contractors				
Property & Design	Architects Management of works and contractors	1fte for ½ day per week	Ongoing	Yes-Property & Design undertook the feasibility costings	Yes

## Full Business Case and Options Appraisal

	Property sales				
Sustainability					
Are any specialist skills required to deliver the programme or project (beyond those identified above)? If so, how will these be acquired?					

### 8. Risks and opportunities

*Assess the risks and opportunities associated with the programme or project by using the council's Risk Management Framework and risk register template. List the most significant risks in the table below and the initial mitigating actions.*

<b>Risk description</b>	<b>Potential consequences</b>	<b>Mitigating controls and actions</b>	<b>Likelihood (1 = almost impossible, 5 = almost certain)</b>	<b>Impact (1 = insignificant, 5 = catastrophic/ fantastic)</b>
Public do not use the self-service provision	Visitor numbers fall Customer satisfaction is low	Provision of one day a week of staff. Recruitment of local volunteers. Developing good relationship with local partners	3	3
Customer expectations are not met	Visitor numbers fall Customer satisfaction is low Service is no longer viable	Public meetings and online consultation has taken place Service will be developed using further stakeholder engagement	3	3

### 9. Outline programme or project plan

*Indicate the timeline for the programme or project with key milestones, including when decisions are needed and by whom, and deliverables.*

Libraries Plan – approved by Council March 2016  
 Agreement to dispose of buildings – at P&R committee in April  
 New staffing arrangements will be implemented from July 2016.  
 Work on the Children's centre will take place in the summer holidays 2016  
 Work on the Community Centre is still to be programmed  
 Estimated move to new locations: Autumn 2016

### 10. Stakeholder consultation

*List any consultations with stakeholders and the findings. Examples of stakeholders include citizens, staff, partner organisations, Members.*

The Library Services Review and Needs Analysis was based on extensive research, consultation and community engagement.  
 Staff and unions have been involved in the Libraries Modernisation programme through



## Full Business Case and Options Appraisal

briefings and workshops throughout 2015.

Three months of public consultation took place November 2015 – February 2016.

Additional consultation took place in Hollingbury: all current library borrowers were individually contacted to alert them to the consultation and invite them to a public meeting that was held in February 2016.

In the analysis of all the responses, the specific question about Hollingbury Library resulted in 48% tending to agree or strongly agree and 22% tending to disagree or strongly disagree, with a high percentage (30%) neither agreed nor disagreed.

An analysis of the responses from those who said they were users of Hollingbury Library (115 respondents) produced a different response: 38% tended to agree or strongly agree; 49% tended to disagree or strongly disagree; and 13% neither agreeing nor disagreeing.

As a result of the concerns raised through the consultation, changes were made to the proposals to re-introduce some staff support. As a result of detailed consultation with the Ward Councillors, creation of an additional Community Library collection in the Old Boat Community Centre in Hollingbury to meet the library needs of all age groups.

### 11. Equalities

*Has an Equalities Impact Assessment been conducted for the programme or project? Is one required? When will it be undertaken?*

An Equalities Impact Assessment has been undertaken using the Budget Setting Template, as part of the Libraries Plan, which was agreed in March 2016.

Potential impacts were identified as a result of the original proposal to only provide a service in the Children's centre. These impacts were mitigated against by the inclusion of a second collection in Hollingbury to meet the library needs of all ages.

Further equalities impact assessment work with the Equalities team will continue to inform the proposals as they develop.

### 12. Sustainability

*What significant environmental impacts is the project likely to have?  
Are there any implications for the local economy and local communities?*

New windows in the Old Boat Community Centre will improve energy efficiency

### Authority to proceed

*This business case needs to be approved via the appropriate governance route before the programme or project can be implemented. Please complete the table below to confirm where this authority was obtained. Please ensure the agreement was minuted*

Meeting where authority to proceed was obtained	Date of meeting



## Full Business Case and Options Appraisal

### Appendix 1: Details of Hollingbury Revenue costs

Hollingbury Library revenue costs

Buildings (libs)	Buildings (property)	Employees (libs)	Supplies & Services	Income	Totals	
£1,353	£12,546	£23,089	£9,138	-£1,456	£44,670	actuals 2014-15

	Buildings	Staffing	Supplies & Services	Income	Totals	
Current costs	£13,900	£23,000	£9,100	-£1,500	£44,500	based on actuals for 2014-15 estimates to be confirmed
Future costs	£9,000	£4,000	£6,000	-£1,000	£18,000	
Savings	£4,900	£19,000	£3,100	-£500	£26,500	

Saving over the years:	Buildings	Staffing	Supplies & Services	Income	Totals	
2016/17	£2,450	£9,500	£1,550	-£250	£13,250	half year remaining half year
2017/18	£2,450	£9,500	£1,550	-£250	£13,250	
2018/19	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0	